An Analysis of Student Understanding About Global Citizenship Education in Jakarta

Asep Rudi Casmana, Dwi Afrimetty Timoera, Iqbal Syafrudin, Aldo Pratama Putra, Firdaus Oktawijaya, Firdaus Hadi Santosa, Atik Kurniawati[1,2,3,4,5,6,7]
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia [1,2,3,4,5.6.7]

Abstract: This study aims to be able to analyze students' understanding of global citizens in Jakarta. Global citizens are citizens who are responsible for meeting institutional and cultural requirements for the greater good of society. The nature of a responsible citizen is the ownership and embodiment of his commitment to integrative values and to the active application of his critical consciousness. This critical awareness includes the ability to think independently, critically and constructively, the ability to see problems in a long-term context, and make judgments based on a commitment to long-term community interests . Seeing the importance of the concept of a global citizen, it is necessary to be able to examine students' understanding of the global citizen. The research method used is descriptive with a qualitative approach. The interviews were conducted on 15 students who were studying at universities in Jakarta. After obtaining the data, it is then analyzed using nVivo. The results of this study show that students in Jakarta have an understanding of global citizens, especially those related to political literacy, community involvement and moral and social responsibility. The implication of this research is to have a positive impact in the academic environment and society.

Keywords: Global Citizenship, Civic Education, Teaching and learning, Understanding, Youth

Introduction

Global citizen is one of the terms that is currently being implemented, both in Indonesia and in citizens of the world. Through the organization of the United Nations, which in this case UNESCO, tried to launch a program to be able to become a citizen of the world . Therefore, the focus of studies on the implementation of global citizens in the current era is very popular. The term global citizen is not in a formal legal sense, where a person has a passport or access that can be used to be able to visit all countries in the world , but the term global citizen refers more to the characters of a person who globally regardless of where their background comes from, as well as being able to help a person or group of different people from his community environment. (Askola, 2012)(Cabrera, 2008)(Tarozzi & Inguaggiato, 2018)(Davies, Gregory, & Riley, 2002)

Currently, the concept of global citizenship refers to the theory presented by Bernard Crick of the United Kingdom. The concept of a global citizen conveyed is to emphasize the

---

[1] Correspondent Author E-Mail: aseprudi@unj.ac.id

kawakter of good citizens. According to Bernard Crick in his book Essays on Citizenship says that global citizens have three main characteristics, namely *political literacy, social and moral responsibility and community involvement* . (Crick, 2000) These three components are indispensable to be able to develop the character and global citizens. *Community involvement* or better known as involvement in society is one of the most important things in the life of the nation and state. This is because by living in society, people can help each other, so that if there is a problem between communities, then they will easily fix and overcome these problems. (Davies, Gregory, & Riley, 2002; Crick, 2000)

Various problems occur caused by the attitude of the community who do not want to mix with other people, or do not want to live in society. This causes the person to be disoriented or does not have a social environment that supports him to continue to develop and blend in with society. So that the person can be excluded and not accepted by other societies in general. With the concept of mutual cooperation, mutual assistance to each other, and tolerance between groups, it reflects the attitudes of global citizens, especially in terms *of community involvement.* One of the causes of the disruption of Indonesia's national identity is the rise of Globalization. The era of Globalization itself can affect this nation in terms of the cultural values of the Indonesian nation. The era of Globalization has come and shifted the values that have existed for a long time. Some of these values are positive, some are negative. All of these are threats, challenges, and at the same time as opportunities for the Indonesian nation to create and innovate in all aspects of life.(Nawaji, 2016)

In the increasingly thick association between nations, there will be a process of acculturation, imitation, and mutual influence between each other's cultures, making every difference a learning that must be followed and carried out. For this reason, based on the precepts of Indonesian unity, education and socio-cultural development are developed on the basis of appreciation for diverse social values from all regions of the archipelago towards achieving a sense of unity as a nation. There must be recognition and appreciation of the education and culture and social life of various groups of the Indonesian nation so that they feel valued and accepted as citizens. With a sense of unity and unity that is established between Indonesian people, it will become the identity of our nation. Like gotong royong which has long been the culture of the Indonesian nation needs to be maintained and preserved in the future because it is the national identity of the Indonesian nation in the eyes of the world.

The identity crisis that occurs in the Indonesian nation, especially the problem of involvement in society, needs to be corrected starting from the root. In this case, one way to be able to improve this is through education. Based on previous studies, there are several ways to be able to fix the identity crisis, one of whose identities is community involvement. Education is one of the ways that can be used to be able to correct the identity crisis regarding involvement in society. In the school environment, pre-students can be given directions and examples and can organize as their provision to be able to socialize and socialize.

Based on the above background regarding the globalization crisis, it is necessary to be able to know students' understanding of global citizens, so that this study will discuss students' understanding of global citizens.

Literature Review
Definition of Global Citizen

Global citizens have a variety of very important roles in the formation of the character of global citizens. The term global citizen has a different definition according to experts. Some assume that a global citizen is someone who is borderless or a person whose passport has a lot of access to various countries, so that thus he can freely visit any country as he pleases . In addition, there are also those who assume that global citizens are people who are involved in social actions regardless of their background from where, both racial, religious, ethnic backgrounds and others. So that in doing so, they can help others who are in trouble . There are also experts who assume that global citizens are people who have a high sense of empathy for others. There are at least three main reasons why global citizens can be formed: (1 (Davies, Mizuyama, Ikeno, Parmenter, & Mori, 2013)(Tarozzi & Inguaggiato, 2018)In terms of history, global citizen groups have existed for a long time, so they can make a good contribution to their country. (2) Since the cold war era, people who are members of global citizens have had a good contribution to society. (3) Next, there are some organizations that are regional in nature, but they have already had an impact on global citizens.

In addition to some of the theories expressed above according to the opinions of experts, these three opinions are also one of the opinions that can make a person a global citizen including Indonesia. According to Professor Bernard Crick (2000), one of the requirements to become a global citizen is the need for responsibility to the community in their environment, including the social environment. This responsibility can be seen from the commitment and integrity of citizens to their communities which can be seen from thinking critically, being sensitive to social problems, the ability to be able to see society in the long term, and being able to actively contribute to society. Thus, they can live in harmony and peace in life. (Crick, 2000)(Davies, Gregory, & Riley, 2002)

In his research, Davies (2013) identified the characteristics of global citizens by having the following characteristics. First, a person identified as a global citizen can approach a social problem or problem from a global point of view. In this case, people are able to be able to read the situations and conditions that exist in society, and its country regarding what is happening at the moment. Second, people who can become global citizens are people who can cooperate with others, not only from people who have the same background, but in terms of different backgrounds, both different religions, tribes, races, and languages. Third, he is responsible for the surrounding community, if he acquires or is assigned to be involved in certain committees or activities. Fourth, he is able to think critically and rationally, that is to say that when looking at the social phenomena that occur, they can calmly and think rationally .(Davies, Mizuyama, & Thompsom, Citizenship Education in Japan, 2010)

In addition to these four characteristics, global citizens are also able to resolve conflicts without violence. The point is that people who have a global psyche, he prefers with a preventive approach or prefers by peaceful means or nonviolent discussions. Furthermore, they have a style or lifestyle that is sensitive to the lingkunga, the meaning is that they are more concerned with protecting the environment than damaging the environment. As well as the latter are global citizens are people who defend human rights and participate in public issues by putting forward information-based technologies .(Nurdin, 2015; Nurdin, 2015; Tarozzi & Inguaggiato, 2018)

Meanwhile, in addition to the eight concepts regarding world citizens mentioned in the eight traits, there are also some additional assumptions according to some experts regarding

world citizens with different characteristics. Among them, the first, world citizens or *global citizens* are people who always have the ability to be able to develop science and very up-to-date scientific principles. The second is in terms of competence, people who belong to the group of world citizens, have the competence to continue to develop in a multidisciplinary manner, or have the skills to continue to prioritize different sciences. And the third is connection, in this case people who are incorporated into global citizens can connect with anyone regardless of distance, besides that they can also work remotely. (Catalan, 2013)(Choo, 2017)(Engel, 2014)

Furthermore, there are other expert opinions that add about the requirements to become a global citizen, including having credibility and high concern for society. Credibility here is to have an honest attitude, care about the community and be able to respect others. The second condition is to have concern and be sensitive to the community. In this case they care selflessly and can provide care and insight to the community that can convey information and enrich its insights .(Daniels, 2018; Toukan, 2017; Standish, 2014)

Global Citizenship Education

Civic education is a science or a subject that teaches students about the rights and obligations of citizens, government and duties and obligations. In addition, citizenship can also be defined as a relationship or relationship between humans and their country, be it citizenship status, or something else. So it can be said that as a citizen, in addition to a status, but also as a relationship between citizens and their country. After understanding the concept of a citizen, next there is what is said to be civic education. In this case, civic education is an education that seeks to educate the younger generation to become democratic citizens, obey the rule of law, be able to help others and others(Askola, 2012)(Bickmore, 2014; Bourke, Bamber, & Lyons, 2012) (Mulyono, 2017; Raihani, 2011). In other words, civic education can be used as a tool to be able to build and prosper the system in a nation.

Civic education certainly has its functions, roles and goals. There is a general purpose of civic education, namely functions and objectives with generally perceived results and outputs. In addition, there is also a purpose of civic education specifically by specializing the purpose of civic education in colleges or schools.

The main purpose of civic education in Indonesia is to foster state insight and awareness, attitudes and behaviors that love the homeland and precipitate the nation's culture, archipelago insight, and national resilience in the future successors of the nation who are and study and will master the knowledge and technology and art(Asgharzadeh & Nazim, 2017). In addition, the purpose of studying other civic education is to improve the quality of Indonesian people who are virtuous, personal, independent, developed, tough, professional, responsible and productive as well as physically and spiritually healthy. The role of citizenship is also quite important for the sustainability of the nation by adding insight and knowledge of citizenship(Cabrera, 2008).

Community Involvement

Community involvement is one of the skills or things that students need to have. School-community engagement is related to collaborative efforts that are important to achieve strategic initiatives or outcomes, so that students or learners have the skills or opportunities to be able to collaborate with other students. The involvement of pelu schools is carried out on an ongoing

basis, so that there is a long-term process carried out by the students and increases cooperation and utilization. (Tarozzi & Inguaggiato, 2018)

Since school-community engagement can be viewed as a means to support student achievement and other positive outcomes, it can be considered as one of the components of the application of global citizens. However, the opportunity for school-community involvement does not facilitate the direct involvement of the principal in the curriculum and teaching in their daily work . For many principals, engaging in school-community engagement requires participation in the development of relationships and maintenance tasks that can sometimes distance them from direct school functions, thus interfering with the hours of the learning process . For example, Hands (2005) states, "the perpetrators take on the role of liaisons or at least function in the capacity of decision makers and gatekeepers for partnerships". The principal experiences a large and unrelenting workload, and the time it takes to engage in the demands of new jobs such as building relationships and engaging outside groups can add to concerns about workload and work-life balance. This increase in workload can be a problem because the impact and sustainability of school-community engagement opportunities can be muted by the principal's inconsistent (or unwilling) leadership. The support of the principle can be a significant factor that contributes to the effective involvement of school-communities, especially where student recruitment activities and the implementation of the program are concerned. Furthermore, principals occupy an influential position in the education system, and the way they view school-community engagement can have an impact on others in their respective schools and in their districts as a whole . (Davies, Mizuyama, & Thompsom, Citizenship Education in Japan, 2010; Davies, Gregory, & Riley, 2002; Tarozzi & Inguaggiato, 2018)(Standish, 2014)(Choo, 2017)(Roberts & Al-Khanji, 2013)(Davies, Mizuyama, & Thompsom, Citizenship Education in Japan, 2010) (Tarozzi & Inguaggiato, 2018)(Roberts & Al-Khanji, 2013)

Methodology
Research Design

This research will use a qualitative approach by using *a descriptive* method. Teachers of Pancasila and Civic Education and other social sciences in elementary schools will be one of the main sources of informants in this study. The *semi-structured interview* method will be used to be able to obtain a very clear and detailed explanation to obtain information about this learning. However, the interview technique may have the disadvantage of being able to gain few participants and it is difficult for the results to be drawn in general. In addition, (Johnson & Christensen, 2008)*focus-group interviews* will also be used to be able to see students' perceptions of global citizens (Biesta, 2012; Newby, 2010). The method of observation in the classroom will also be carried out to be able to know firsthand how the teacher created a global citizen practically.

Data Collection Techniques and Research Locations

To be able to obtain comprehensive data on students' understanding of global citizens, there are several data collection methods or techniques that will be used in order to obtain maximum data. The first is by conducting interviews with teachers, and the second is by making direct observations that can be used to see how the conditioning of students and also how school

culture can shape global citizens. The first is to use the interview method. Interviews are one of the methods used to be able to obtain data to the maximum and be able to answer the question of why or why teachers do or choose by using this method. More specifically, the interview used is a(Biesta, 2012) *semi-structured interview,* where this interview method can be used casually and not fixated on the questions that have been arranged. Even the interviewer can also add other questions of a conditional nature to be able to obtain maximum data .(Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2007)

Furthermore, the second method is by observation. After obtaining the data obtained from the interview results, researchers also need to look at school culture every day. This observation can be used to see firsthand what is happening in the school . Thus, the results of interviews with observation results can be used as the main data to obtain maximum results. (Newby, 2010)

Data Analysis Techniques

To be able to analyze the results of the research, *content analysis* will be used to see the results of the interview. The data that has been obtained will be copied and continued with analysis using *open coding, axial coding* and *selective coding* using Nvivo. That software will be of great help in analyzing the results of the interview. However, it is undeniable that there are some weaknesses that may be found from the results of this study. One of them is the data retrieval technique. *Non-random sampling techniques* will be difficult to generalize. In addition, it may also be a *double-blind effect* that may be one of the problems during interviews and observations. So researchers have prepared for this.

Findings & Discussion

Global citizens are a moral community based on issues of global concern such as human rights, the environment and poverty issues. Global citizens are not territorially, legally and politically, socially and culturally bound to a country, in this context going beyond those traditional boundaries. However, moral movements carried out by global citizens can encourage political and legal policies in a country. An example is, the existence of executions, although it is the autonomous authority of a state, that policy can be opposed by people, individuals or other communities from different parts of the world. These interventions are of course not political and legal, but rather moral in nature. When a citizen of a country participates in issues that become universal issues, at the same time he is also a global citizen.

Global citizens who relate only to the moral community and are not based on territorially bound issues, but such moral activities can have an impact on global life. Other issues that are often of global concern in addition to issues related to the environment and food or human rights, related to freedom of opinion, obtaining information, freedom of assembly and expression. Everyone who participates in such issues is a global citizen, not because their activities go beyond their national territory, but mainly because the issues they strive for are also of concern to the global community.

Based on this context, as a prospective teacher who will teach the context of civic education to students, it is necessary to be able to understand and understand the context of global citizens. So that this section will explain the results of the analysis of students' understanding of the context of global citizens. In general, students' understanding of global

citizens is divided into three main parts, including students' understanding of how to teach political literacy to students, secondly students' understanding of how to teach engagement in society and the third is students' understanding of how to do it.

Understanding of Political Literacy

Political literacy can be defined as a knowledge, skills and attitudes that need to be possessed by everyone, both men and women, by knowing the political context and can be implemented in political life. In addition, political literacy can also be said to be a knowledge, skill and attitude that can make a person participate actively and efficiently as well as critically and responsibly and can update government affairs at all levels of government. Indonesia can be said to be a country that highly upholds the main principles of politics that occurs, so as a democracy, Indonesia really needs a society that is educated and also has high intellectuals. In other words, Indonesia really needs citizens who have awareness and understanding of every issue and political policy and also the government bureaucracy so that thus society can be said to be a political literacy.

In a community environment where the population already understands or is politically literate, then they can be said to be a society that is aware of its obligations in carrying out various tasks including in terms of the enactment of laws and also social awareness. So in this context, prospective teachers need to be able to understand and understand what is happening in politics both in the national and international contexts.

"In the school environment, education has a very important role in educating students to be able to become someone with a very high level of political literacy. So this concept has a very big role" Interview, Student 2

According to one of the opinions of respondents, education is one way to be able to provide access and attention that is very more and also has improvements to certain awareness awareness both for students and as a citizen by doing some actions and paying attention to a seriousness in working on the ongoing bureaucratic system of knowledge. As an educational institution, it is necessary to be able to be one of the processes in improving the quality and quantity of these very deep goals. The purpose of this activity is to become a good habit, so that it can be included in the students who can meet a government.

The concept of political literacy has also become a learning study that has a very strategic role, especially since it is applied continuously. Meanwhile, education and schools are said to be a very appropriate means in channeling and teaching about understanding politics both domestically and abroad so that concepts and knowledge about politics can be achieved.

"As a teacher-to-be, I assume that school is the most appropriate place to teach political literacy. This is also true because the subjects of Pancasila and Civic Education have taught about political learning in the classroom" interview, student 5

Political literacy is also some very strategic material and learning, especially in the scope of education. It is said that schools are a vehicle or place to be able to channel knowledge and

understanding of the current politics. So that the program is well conceptualized, then knowledge of politics can be implemented properly and balanced and remain proportionate. In addition to this context, the concept of literacy also has the ability to be able to provide opportunities for students to be able to participate actively and also directly in the national scope. When a student who already understands politics, that person will understand about thinking and can respect a decision and also a maximum policy.

> *"To be able to teach students about political literacy, schools need special subjects that can study the current politics both in national and international scope" interview, student 4*

One of the subjects that teaches about political literacy is Pancasila and Citizenship Education. This subject has been designed to be able to increase one's political participation and also prepare future generations who can be active both in civil life and in political life and also the public. Civic Education also has a role, namely being able to foster insight and awareness of nation and state as well as attitudes and love for the homeland with the nation's culture, archipelago insight, and national resilience in the prospective successors of the nation who are currently studying science and technology that can help a person to be able to improve one's quality of life to the fullest. In addition, there are several other purposes of civic education, namely to be able to make a person to be more productive and virtuous, have a personality, independent, advanced, tough, professional, responsible and productive as well as physically and spiritually healthy. The role of citizenship is also quite important for the sustainability of the nation by adding insight and knowledge of citizenship.

> *"Civic Education is very helpful for teachers in teaching about political literacy, because there is a chapter specifically that discusses the concept of political literacy" Interview, student 3*

The concept of Civic Education has a very broad scope rather than just focusing on democratic education and human rights education. This is because the study of Civic Education concerns various things, including the government, constitution, democratic institutions, rule of law, rights and obligations of citizens in civil society, knowledge of several state institutions and systems contained in government, politics, public administration and law as well as knowledge of human rights, active citizenship and several other materials.

> *"The subject of Citizenship Education aims to be able to prepare to be a citizen who has knowledge and understands the rights and obligations as a citizen, intelligent, critical, active, participatory, love the homeland, democratic, tolerant, respecting human rights, obeying the law, caring for others, preparing to become a global society, and so on" Interview, student 1*

In the final context, citizens and civic education have the ultimate goal of becoming a civil society. In the end, it boils down to the formation of civil society. Civics are based on Pancasila, norms, and ethics that apply in the midst of a plural Indonesian society. The values of local wisdom are also instilled in enriching insight, understanding, and strengthening the spirit of love for the land in order to maintain the integrity of the Republic of Indonesia. The three basic competencies of civic education include; (1) civic knowledge, (2) civic disposition, and (3) civic skills. Civic knowledge is related to equipping students with a number of knowledge that is the basis as citizens who are intelligent, critical, democratic, respect human rights, obey the

law, know political rights and obligations as citizens, know the role of state institutions, and so on.

Involvement in the Community

Civic engagement or citizen participation is an activity to bring about changes in the lives of citizens or communities that combine various aspects such as aspects of knowledge, attitudes, skills, values and motivation to make these changes. This action is an effort to improve the quality of life of the people, "both through politics and non-politics. Civic engagement can also be interpreted as one of the elements or actions of citizens who participate in the life of society in order to improve the conditions of other communities in the surrounding environment, help and shape the future of society. Civic engagement or involvement in society is one of the main component parts as a global citizen. A person involved in the context of society will be able to build his students to be more active and involved in society.

> *"Public participation in society is a very important element in the learning*
> *process, so this must be to be practiced in everyday life" Interview, student 6*

Political participation is one part of the civic attitude. With political participation, it can justify and also participate in supporting the character of global citizens. The attitude of citizenship is related to the internalization of good character in each student, love for the homeland, democratic, tolerant, respecting human rights, being willing to sacrifice, being helpful, honest, discipline, responsibility, and so on. Civic skills relate to the ability to practice civic knowledge and reflect civic attitudes in everyday life, being able to participate in the formulation, implementation, and supervision of public policies.

Based on the description above, civics subjects are very strategic in building the character of the nation. Currently, there are five values that are focused on strengthening through KDP integrated in the 2013 curriculum, namely: (1) religious, (2) nationalist, (3) integrity, (4) independent, and (5) mutual cooperation. The proclamator of indonesian independence post-independence emphasized the importance of nation and *character building*. Countries in Asia such as Japan, South Korea, and China are very able to advance by leaps and bounds and become economic powers that the world counts because they have a strong character.

> *"Civic education can be one of the places to be able to motivate students to be able*
> *to be actively involved in society" Interview, teacher 2*

The role of Pancasila and Civic Education when in the school environment is to strive to be able to encourage its students to be able to participate directly in the community environment. Thus, civic education can help teachers in developing the abilities of their citizens or what is commonly called civic skills. The context of the civic study can also help students so that they can be actively involved in every civic activity. This is because this community activity is able to encourage and make someone to participate in the community, so a teacher needs to be able to encourage it. When there is encouragement and motivation, it can help students to be actively involved in the community.

References

Roberts, D. C., & Al-Khanji, K. (2013). Preparing Global Citizens. *Journal of College & Character, 14*(1), 85-92.

Lilley, K., Barker, M., & Harris, N. (2015). Educating global citizens: a good 'idea' or an organisational practice? *Higher Education Research & Development*, 1-15.

Murdiono, M. (349-357). Civic Education To Build Global Insights Of Young Citizens. *Educational Horizons, 33*(3), 2014.

Sutrisno. (2018). The Role of Civic Education in Building Global Citizens. *Citizenship Journal of Pancasila and Citizenship*, 41-51.

Nawaji. (2016). Development of Character Education Design through Learning Civic Education Subjects in Elementary Schools. *Education Management and Supervision, 1*(3), 1-16.

Davies, I., Mizuyama, M., Ikeno, N., Parmenter, L., & Mori, C. (2013). Political Literacy in Japan and England. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education, 12*(3), 163-173. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.2304/csee.2014.12.3.163

Tarozzi, M., & Inguaggiato, C. (2018). Implementing global citizenship education in EU primary schools: The role of government ministries. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning, 10*(1), 21-38. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.18546/IJDEGL.10.1.03

Crick, B. (2000). *Essays on citizenship.* London: Bloomsbury Publishing.

Davies, I., Gregory, I., & Riley, S. (2002). *Good citizenship and educational provision.* Routledge.

Davies, I., Mizuyama, M., & Thompsom, G. H. (2010). Citizenship Education in Japan. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education , 9*(3), 170-178. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.2304/csee.2010.9.3.170

Nurdin, E. S. (2015). The Policies on Civic Education in Developing National Character in Indonesia. *International Education Studies, 8*(8), 199-209. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ies.v8n8p199

Catalano, T. A. (2013). Occupy: A case illustration of social movements in global citizenship education. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 8*(3), 276 –288. doi:10.1177/1746197913497661

Choo, S. (2017). Global education and its tensions: case studies of two schools in Singapore and the United States. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 1-15. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2017.1386088

Engel, L. C. (2014). Global citizenship and national (re) formations: Analysis of citizenship education reform in Spain. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 9*(3), 239 –254. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1177/1746197914545927

Daniels, S. J. (2018). Global Citizenship Education and Human Rights in Scottish education: An analysis of education policy. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, 1-5. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1177/2047173418769910

Toukan, E. V. (2017). Educating citizens of 'the global': Mapping textual constructs of UNESCO's global citizenship education 2012–2015. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 13*(1), 51-64. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1177/1746197917700909

Standish, A. (2014). What is global education and where is it taking us? *Curriculum Journal, 25*(2), 166-186.

Askola, H. (2012). Tale of Two Citizenships? Citizenship, Migration and Care in the European Union. *Social & Legal Studies, 21*(3), 341–356. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1177/0964663912440817

Bickmore, K. (2014). Citizenship education in Canada: 'Democratic' engagement with differences, conflicts and equity issues? *Citizenship Teaching & Learning, 9*(3), 257-278. doi:10.1386/ctl.9.3.257_1

Bourke, L., Bamber, P., & Lyons, M. (2012). Global citizens: Who are they? *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 7*(2), 161-174. doi:10.1177/1746197912440858

Asgharzadeh, A., & Nazim, Z. (2017). The Enlightenment conceptions of pedagogy and global citizenship education: A Canadian case study. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 00*(0), 1-4. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/1746197917731276

Cabrera, L. (2008). Global citizenship as the completion of cosmoplitanism. *Journal of International Political Theory, 4*(1), 84–104. doi:10.3366/E1755088208000104

Johnson, B., & Christensen, B. (2008). *Educational research: quantitative, qualitative, and mixed approaches.* Sage.

Biesta, G. (2012). Mixed methods. In J. Arthur, *Research methods and methodologies in education.* Sage publications.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research methods in education (7th edition).* Routledge.

Newby, P. (2010). *Research methods for education.* Research methods for education.

About the Author:

Chief Researcher
Asep Rudi Casmana
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
Researcher Member
Dwi Afrimetty Timoera
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
Iqbal Syafrudin
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
Aldo Pratama Putra
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
Firdaus Oktawijaya
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
Firdaus Hadi Santosa
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
Atik Kurniawati
Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia