

Domestic Travelers Perception Shifting on the New Face of Malioboro

Marista Christina Shally Kabelen,¹ Meila Riska Fitri,² Suyuti³

Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia^{1,2,3}

Abstract: *Until recent time, Malioboro still become one of prime tourism destination from Indonesia. The local tourism office continues to improve related aspect with the recent revitalization steps that have just been carried out in 2021 are the arrangement of facades or the outside of buildings and sidewalks alongside Jalan Malioboro and the relocation of a total of 1,800 Street Vendors (Pedagang Kaki Lima - PKL) in the area to the new location; Teras Malioboro 1 and 2. As the impact, various responses emerged and a shift in tourism perception occurred. This study aims to determine perception shifting related to the views and opinions of tourists on the “new face” of the Malioboro. The research methodology used is qualitative research with a descriptive approach. Data retrieval was carried out in the Malioboro Street area in the Province of the Special Region of Yogyakarta. The data retrieval method used was observation and in-depth interviews with purposive sampling. The study result showed that there was a shift in the perception of tourism activity within domestic tourist in the Malioboro area from what was originally not just a walking activity but including cheap shopping activities with street vendors to just sightseeing and selfie tour alongside Malioboro street. Tourists now only see Malioboro as a destination for sightseeing and selfies.*

Keywords: *perception shifting, policy impact, revitalization, tourist*

Introduction

Until recent time, the Special Region of Yogyakarta, with all its well-preserved cultural heritage, beautiful panoramas of various natural areas, and the cultural wisdom of its people is still become a tourist destination that always fascinates both domestic and foreign travelers. 2020 data informs that there are a total of 91 tourist attractions in the Special Region of Yogyakarta consisting of 32 natural attractions, 42 artificial attractions, and 17 historical attractions (Bappeda, 2022). In terms of tourist visits records, in 2020 there were 40.570 foreign travelers and 1,344,211 domestic travelers. This data is calculated based on the number of tourists staying at hotels spread throughout the city of Yogyakarta and combined with data on ticket sales at various tourist attractions in the city of Yogyakarta (Dinas Pariwisata, 2020). Nevertheless, we can believe that the number of tourist visitors in the Yogyakarta City Area are much larger considering that there are so many tourist areas that do

¹ maristashally@unj.ac.id

not apply entrance tickets for their visitors or do not have the record and 2020 is a time when tourism activities are quite depressed due to the Covid-19 pandemic.

One of the tourism attractions in the Special Region of Yogyakarta that continues to be the first choice is the Malioboro Street area. For most tourists, local and foreign, Malioboro is a destination that is can't be missed when traveling in Yogyakarta. We can define Malioboro as a shopping center area in Yogyakarta City, Indonesia, which is crowded with domestic and foreign daily visitors (Cahya et al., 2017). Malioboro Street has always been known for its cheap shopping tours for various souvenirs, snacks, and various interesting knick-knacks. The Malioboro Street area was established simultaneously with the establishment of the Yogyakarta Palace. In the colonial era (1790-1945), various developments were also carried out in the Malioboro Street area such as the construction of Fort Vredeburg (1790), Societeit Der Vereniging Djogdjakarta (1822), The Dutch Governor's Residence (1830), Javasche Bank and the Central Post Office (Dinas Pariwisata, 2019). Currently these buildings are one of the main supports for the tourism magnet of the Malioboro area, especially for photography enthusiast, either just for selfies or more professional travel photography.

Figure 1

Malioboro Street Condition before Revitalization



The government through the Tourism Office continues to gradually promote and improve the management of the Malioboro area by beautifying the Malioboro area through the arrangement of the facade, or also the exterior of the building alongside Malioboro Street. The recent step to revitalize the Malioboro area is the relocation of a total of 1,800 street vendors (Pedagang Kaki Lima-PKL) in the Malioboro area and centralized to the new locations of Teras Malioboro 1 and Teras Malioboro 2 (Rukmorini & Anugrahanto, 2022). Various responses came after the revitalization process was completed. Some tourists are said to be more unimpeded to enjoy the Malioboro area because it is more comfortable, neater, and more accommodating to pedestrians, but some others feel that Malioboro is not Malioboro anymore (Susanto, 2022).

Malioboro, which we used to know as a tourist place that offers cheap shopping tours and also cheap snacking and eating, has now changed its face and function. The street vendors who were originally in the sidewalk in front of the shop have been moved to what is now known as the Teras Malioboro 1 and Teras Malioboro 2. Meanwhile when shopping at the Teras Malioboro it feels similar to shopping at the Beringharjo market which already exists near in the Malioboro area also. The changes that occurred in Malioboro eventually resulted in a shift in the perception of "Traveling in Malioboro" that occurred. There are tourists who

feel that tourism in Malioboro is now just for hanging out and selfies activities, there are some who really intend to shop at one of the shops on Jalan Malioboro, some are just "crossing out" the checklist of Yogyakarta tourism destination while visit Yogyakarta City.

Figure 2

Malioboro Street Condition after Revitalization



The author sees that the revitalization of the Malioboro area causes changes in tourist perceptions in viewing tourism to Malioboro. Various opinions that emerged after the steps to revitalize the Malioboro area which were taken through the relocation of street vendors became the basis of the author's interest in conducting research with the title Domestic Travelers Perception Shifting on the New Face of Malioboro. This study aims to describe how the shifts in the perception of tourists, especially domestic tourists, related to the new face of the Malioboro tourist area.

Literature Review

Tourism has always been an interesting topic to study. From the tourism activity itself, its supporting aspects, to the impacts that arise because of implementing policies in a particular tourist area. Changes in lifestyle, cultural changes including the way of dressing are one of the common impacts of tourism activities in an area. The social structure of society and the structure of culture can experience a shift because of tourism (Hafsah & Yusuf, 2019). The development of tourism also has an impact on socio-cultural life. People who can directly interact with tourists certainly have a change in behavior (Murniatmo et al., 1994). The availability of good management human resources is also the main support for the success of tourism activities, not only a charming and interesting tourist attraction. Thus, the presence of tourism related higher education institutions (university or college) also have a role in developing a country's tourism (Saryani, 2015). Malioboro as a superior tourist attraction in the Special Region of Yogyakarta is also often the object of research, for example related to the analysis of satisfaction with its tourist attraction (Baharuddin et al., 2016), as well as how the tourists' perceptions of the results of government policy implementation, for example the arrangement of the pedestrian area (Prayuda et al., 2020).

The relocation of street vendors (PKL), as studied in this study, has also been studied in previous various studies. Reynaldo C. Aotama examined how the relocation of street vendors in the Culinary Tourism Area of Tomohon City brought social impacts related to aspects of legal certainty and guarantee, security and order, comfort and cleanliness, and also competition between traders and social relations between traders (Aotama & Rosaltne, 2021). Although there are some obstacles, especially related to the lack of government attention to

the rejuvenation and development of the new location which has an impact on the decrease in traders selling in the area. Some time, the relocation of street vendors also only seems to move the problems from one new place to another. For example, the relocation of street vendors from the Sidoarjo Public Square to the Sidoarjo Public Sports Arena (Gedung Olahraga – GOR). The impact of this relocation causes the street traders to have to start over their business relatively from scratch. Furthermore, the new location also affected and becomes chaotic, dirty, and looks slum (Karuniawan et al., 2015). The temporary duration of the relocation gives additions to the complexity of the problem. Some of the problems that often arise from street vendors relocation are related to increasingly uncertain income tentu (Karuniawan et al., 2015; Prasetya & Fauziah, 2016), as well as traders' resistance due to concerns about economic problems (Prasetya & Fauziah, 2016). Even so, some traders also find it helpful to the existing relocation policy (Aotama & Rosaltne, 2021; Karuniawan et al., 2015; Prasetya & Fauziah, 2016).

Human perception often shifts due to certain events and influences. These changes can also be temporary and often permanent. A perception will arise when the community or someone is sensitive to the circumstances or social phenomena that occur (Listyana & Hartono, 2015). Perceptions will arise depending on educational background, religion, occupation, and other factors. Perception is an assumption based on experience or knowledge so that sometimes it differs from one person to another or sometimes differs from the actual condition (Akbar, 2015). Various things can also cause a change in perception. Galbiati et.al, for example, reveals how the law can influence human perceptions of certain norms, for example government policy (Galbiati et al., 2021). Laws can provide information that can lead to major changes in the perception of existing social norms. Kastanakis and Voyer also conducted research on how culture affects perception. Their study provides consistent evidence for cultural variation in two pre-behavioral mechanism: perception and cognition. This result provides a basis for re-conceptualizing consumers' perceptual and cognitive orientation across the world significantly shaped by collectively generated and shared practices, values, norms and beliefs behind culture, as well as self-view and language (Kastanakis & Voyer, 2014).

Methodology

In this study, qualitative research methods are conducted, which is research based on descriptive data in the form of written or oral descriptions or words from informants and observations. Descriptive research is a method used to describe or analyze research results but is not used in making broad conclusions (Sugiyono, 2018).

The research subject or informant is someone who provides information about the situation and conditions related to the research place (Suwandi, 2008). Selection of informants was carried out by purposive sampling, which is the selection of the characteristics or requirements of the informants that had been previously determined in accordance with the research objectives (Suharsimi, 2006), in this study there were 15 domestic tourists selected. The informants whose data were taken had different backgrounds, namely students, civil servants, private employees, teachers, and not working. The recapitulation of informant data is presented in the following table:

Table 1
Informants Data

NO.	INISIAL	AGE (YEARS)	ORIGIN CITY
1.	BH	41	Surabaya
2.	RKP	39	Surabaya
3.	EJK	21	Yogyakarta
4.	HNR	24	Yogyakarta
5.	FU	21	Yogyakarta
6.	MA	21	Situbondo
7.	FA	21	Ponorogo
8.	NC	21	Purworejo
9.	RAK	21	Yogyakarta
10.	NRA	20	Yogyakarta
11.	AAA	21	Yogyakarta
12.	MJR	22	Jakarta
13.	YGW	21	Kebumen
14.	PN	37	Yogyakarta
15.	IKZ	21	Yogyakarta

Data collection techniques were carried out by 3 main methods, which is observation, interviews, and documentation. Observation is the initial focus in data collection. Data collection by observation is intended to complete deficiencies and verify data taken by other methods (Sugiyono, 2018). Observations in this study were carried out by observing domestic tourists in the Malioboro area with different time characters. The second technique is interviews. Interview is the method of data collection by question and answer. Interview technique is used to take directly how the responses, opinions, and perceptions of existing domestic tourists to the new Malioboro condition. Interviews were conducted using a structured technique, which is interviews with previously prepared questions. Interviews were conducted randomly with domestic tourists that the researchers met around the Malioboro area. The results of the interviews are summarized in the report to facilitate the analysis of the data findings. The last technique, namely documentation, is a method of collecting data by collecting notes or photos and/or videos related to informants and the conditions in which the data was collected.

Findings & Discussion

The Malioboro tourism area is an area in the city of Yogyakarta which has become a tourist destination that is highly visited by domestic and foreign tourists. Currently, sidewalks and street vendors have been arranged along the Jalan Malioboro area. In accordance with the Yogyakarta Special Region Governor's Circular Letter No. 3 concerning the Arrangement of Special Pedestrian Areas on Malioboro Street and Margo Mulyo Street and also the Yogyakarta Mayor Regulation No. 13 of 2022 concerning the Revocation of Yogyakarta Mayor Regulation No. 37 of 2010 concerning the Arrangement of Street Vendors in the

Special Malioboro Area – A. Yani, all street vendors are prohibited from carrying out economic activities including buying and selling along Jalan Malioboro since February 1, 2022. Currently they are placed on Teras Malioboro I and Teras Malioboro II, thus one of the images and attractions of Malioboro through various souvenirs and culinary traded along the path has been lost. Various community reactions become an unavoidable impact, including changes in tourist perceptions of tourist activities in Malioboro.

In general, all of the informants said that the new Malioboro impression is now more neat, more organized, and less chaotic. As one of the informants, RKP said:

Sebenarnya jujur lebih rapi ya, nggak semrawut seperti dulu, terus jalan kan juga lebih enak ya, kalau dulu kan jalannya agak berdempet-dempetan sama orang.

Translate: Actually, honestly, its more neat now, not as chaotic as it used to be. It is also more comfortable to walk around, not lie the past when it was a bit huddled together with many people.

Likewise, informan MA gave a similar opinion, feeling that the current condition was neater:

Jadi kelihatan lebih rapi aja sih di jalannya gitu kan. Nggak kayak berkerumun banyak yang di pedagang-pedagangnya gitu.

Translate: So, it just looks neater on the road, doesn't it. It's not feels like there are a lot of crowds at the street merchants.

Several other informants also said that the current condition of Malioboro is more comfortable and more eye pleasing because it feels wider in view. Tourists view Malioboro today as cleaner, more organized. Traffic of people and motorized vehicles is more organized and neater.

These various opinions can actually be an indication of the success of the restructuring program held by the government. This is because after all, the purpose of this arrangement is to create a new image for the Malioboro Street area which is more organized, clean, and comfortable for tourists.

As in the following discussion, the impression of being neater and more organized was the change that was most visible or felt by the informants, replacing the previous impression that in Malioboro we had to jostle and fight over the sidewalk with traders. However, what is interesting is that several informants described their longing for impulsive shopping interactions because they saw the merchandise served by street vendors along Malioboro. Informant RKK revealed how often they are incidentally interested in existing merchandise found in the street vendor:

Sebenarnya satu yang dirindukan itu adalah keramaiannya ya. Kalau pas ada PKL itu kan kadang kita nggak ada niat belanja terus cuman jalan terus lihat ada yang lucu, ada yang menarik terus beli. Cuman kalau sekarang kan nggak ada sama sekali ya, terus harus ke teras Malioboro itu ya.

Translate: Actually, one thing that is missed is the crowd. When there are street vendors, sometimes we don't have the intention to shop, we just walk and see something funny, something interesting and impulsively buy. It's just that now it's not there at all, right, then if you want to buy it you have to go to the Terrace Malioboro, okay?

The HNR informant also revealed that prior to the revitalization and relocation, there were relatively frequent snacks traded in Malioboro. In the pre-revitalization condition, you can still do snack activities at several food counters along Malioboro street.

Another interesting thing is that the warm interactions that used to exist, whether between tourists and traders, or fellow tourists when they were gathered at the same street vendor location turned out to be something that tourists impressed and missed. As stated by informant FA:

Pastinya untuk suasananya kalau dulu itu lebih hangat ya, kehangatannya lebih terasa karena kita itu jarak dengan PKL (penjual) itu tidak ada dan saat kita membeli karena memang keramaiannya itu cukup padat, jadinya sering adanya cerita-cerita antar wisatawan. Mungkin antar kita dengan penjual ataupun kita dengan wisatawan yang sedang antre membeli yang dijual itu tadi.

Translate: Of course, for the situation or atmosphere, it was warmer in the past, the warmth was more felt because we felt that there was no distance from street vendors sellers and when we bought, because the crowds were quite dense, there were often stories between tourists. Maybe between us and the seller or us and the tourists who are in line to buy what was sold earlier.

Shifting Perception of Traveling in Malioboro

With the things that distinguish tourists between traveling in Malioboro before revitalization and now, of course it also affects their perception in interpreting "tourism in Malioboro" activities. As per Cambridge dictionary definition, perception is a belief or opinion, often held by many people and based on how things seem (Cambridge Dictionary, 2022).

The first perception that emerges is as nostalgia or reminiscing and comparing with the memories from previous time. Given the significant difference between the conditions before and after the revitalization, of course, tourists who had previously visited Malioboro in the period before the revitalization would be able to compare them with the current condition, as stated by EJK:

Dulu saya masih banyak familiarnya begitu, masih belanja-belanja kalau sekarang mungkin lebih ke nostalgianya mas. Saya nostalgia mengingat masa-masa dulu yang menurut saya lebih enak dulu sih.

Translate: In the past, there were a lot of things that I familiar with it, I'm still shopping before. Now, maybe it's more like nostalgia, bro. I'm nostalgic remembering the old days which personally I think were better.

The next perception is that currently traveling to Malioboro is just walking around without shopping. This is different from the previous perception that traveling to Malioboro is not just a walk but also snacks and shopping for souvenirs or knick-knacks traded by street vendors. Currently traveling to Malioboro has become much simpler. Informant FU reinforce this description:

Mungkin ada ya, ketika dulu saya berkunjung ke Malioboro tujuan utama lebih ke berbelanja, tetapi kalau sekarang lebih ke jalan-jalan saja karena pedagang sudah sangat berkurang dan tidak ada lagi tujuan untuk berbelanja itu.”

Translate: Maybe, when I used to visit Malioboro before the main purpose was shopping, but now I just go for a walk because there are very few merchants and there is no longer any purpose for shopping.

Likewise, the MA informants feel that the current condition of Malioboro is more suitable for traveling because the situation is more relaxed so that the conditions of Malioboro can be enjoyed more.

The YGW informant also expressed the same thing by emphasizing the loss of the purpose of snacking or eating when visiting Malioboro:

Kalau dulu tujuan saya datang ke Malioboro adalah untuk makan. Makan dengan teman-teman. Menikmati keindahan Maliboro itu nomor satu, tetapi membeli sesuatu atau mengonsumsi sesuatu itu juga menjadi tujuan kami pada saat itu. Namun sekarang, ketika sudah ada relokasi, tujuan saya itu menjadi berubah. Saya lebih ke jalan-jalan, bertemu teman saya, kemudian untuk tujuan berbelanja itu sudah tidak menjadi tujuan utama. Kalau dari saya pribadi, saya masih kurang tertarik untuk mengunjungi Teras Malioboro itu sendiri. Jadi jelas tujuan saya datang dari yang dulu masih ada PKL dengan sekarang yang sudah dilakukan relokasi ini jauh berbeda.

Translate: In the past, my purpose in coming to Malioboro was to eat. Eat with friends. Enjoying the beauty of Malioboro was number one, but buying something or consuming something was also our goal at that time. But now, when there has been a relocation, my goal has changed. I prefer to travel, meet my friends, then for shopping purposes it is no longer the main goal. Personally, I'm still not interested in visiting the Malioboro Terrace itself. So, it's clear that my goal came from that in the past there were still street vendors and now the relocation that has been carried out is much.

Informants NC, RAK, AAA also expressed the same perception regarding a trip to Malioboro after the revitalization.

In addition, there is also a perception related to the curiosity of the public wanting to know how the new face of Malioboro after the revitalization will be. Various news related to the new face of Malioboro circulating in the mass media or viral on social media certainly

invites curiosity for the public so that it raises the desire to come directly and see the results of the existing revitalization as stated by the NRA informant:

Tapi kalau misalnya kalau untuk tujuannya tetep sama sih untuk jalan-jalan aja, untuk ngelihatın sekitar gitu, lebih kayak gimana sih kondisi Malioboro yang sekarang.

Translate: But for example, if the purpose is still the same, just take a walk or to look around, more like to know what is the current new condition of Malioboro?

These various things that are memorable and then disappear will certainly affect their perception when they will return to Malioboro. Although it needs to be studied more deeply whether this missing thing can be compensated for with the new impression of Malioboro which is neater, cleaner, and more comfortable.

Furthermore, when discuss about category of the generation that dominates visits to Malioboro are generation Y and generation Z. Generation Y are those who born in the 1980-1995 period, with the main characteristics such as the different characters depending on their background, more open communication patterns, more open to political and economic views, have more attention to wealth, their lives are strongly influenced by technology and by that fluent social media users, and also they seem very reactive to changes in the environment that occur around them. While generation Z are those born in the period 1995-2010, with almost the same characteristics as generation Y, but since childhood this generation has been familiar with technology and sophisticated gadgets that affect their personality indirectly (Putra, 2016). Generation Z relies heavily on technology, gadgets, and activities on social media. They even prioritize popularity, number of followers and likes in their daily lives. Millennials spend an average of six to seven hours per week on social media, while 44 percent of Gen Z check their social media at least every hour.

The difference in these characteristics also affects their perception of expectations and how they interpret tourism in Malioboro. For generation Z who are heavily influenced by social media life, the current conditions are certainly very supportive of their expectations. The condition in the new Malioboro which is more neat, more organized, of course, it becomes more social media post-friendly compared to the previous conditions. In the Malioboro-before revitalization period which were more crowded and often jostled, it become more difficult for them to take photos and create it as social media status or post update material. For generation Y, the changes in Maliboro's face trigger their reactions in various ways, which may be influenced by their individual characters. Nostalgic and curious reactions, for example, how when traveling to Malioboro now creates a sense of wanting to compare it with memories of visiting Malioboro before the relocation they had previously experienced. Which then evokes various reactions. Or, how the spontaneous reaction that arises is curiosity to see how the results of the revitalization and relocation of street vendors that have been completed by the government, and then again "compared". This arises because previous experiences of traveling in Malioboro played a role in shifting their current perception.

Expectance of The Tourist Condition in Malioboro Area

This study also adds a discussion of expectations related to tourism in the Malioboro Area as captured when data collection through interviews was carried out. Some of the hopes for tourism in the Malioboro Area that were conveyed were promotions related to the new street vendors area as a result of revitalization so that traders still get consumers, better handling of environmental hygiene, arrangement of the Teras Malioboro as a center for street vendors so that it becomes a tourist sub-destination in Malioboro which also attracts tourists, Malioboro has to become a tourist spot that is more memorable at home and has to become an icon of Yogyakarta and Indonesia with its various hospitality and facilities, promotions related to the more attractive Malioboro area are not only related to tidiness and cleanliness but also with various events or other attractions that highlight the elements of cultural identity and Yogyakarta specialties. The last one is related to the implementation of the concept of sustainable tourism development in the Malioboro area.

Conclusion

Revitalization of pedestrian areas and shopping facades in the Malioboro Street area in accordance with the Yogyakarta Special Region Governor's Circular Letter No. 3 concerning the Arrangement of Special Pedestrian Areas on Malioboro Street and Margo Mulyo Street and also the Yogyakarta Mayor Regulation No. 13 of 2022 concerning the Revocation of Yogyakarta Mayor Regulation No. 37 of 2010 concerning the Arrangement of Street Vendors in the Special Malioboro Area – A. Yani, produces various impacts, including new perceptions for tourists.

The impression of the new face of Malioboro that appears on domestic tourists is that the current condition is neater, less chaotic, more organized. From the comfort side of tourists when visiting the new Malioboro, it is more comfortable for tourists to walk around because they are no longer fighting over the area with traders. In addition, tourists feel that the current travel view is better because there is not a lot of "noise". These various opinions can be a positive signal of the success of the government's revitalization policy.

From the perspective of traveling, there has been a shift in perception from what was previously a complex activity, not just taking a walk but supplementing with impulsively snacks, or shopping to buy various souvenirs or knick knacks sold by street traders to new perceptions of tourism activity in Malioboro. The first perception is related to nostalgia or reminiscing and comparing with previous conditions. The dominant perception that emerged was to just walk around without shopping, snacking or eating. In addition, there are several tourists who are currently visiting Malioboro to answer their curiosity about the new condition of Malioboro after the revitalization.

In addition, there are several hopes for Malioboro expressed, namely the arrangement of the Malioboro Terrace area as a new merchant location, promotions related to the Malioboro Terrace area, brand image-ing Malioboro as an icon of Yogyakarta and Indonesia, as well as adding various events or attractions that highlight cultural identity and privileges of Yogyakarta, and finally the implementation of sustainable tourism development.

References

- Akbar, R. F. (2015). Analisis Persepsi Pelajar Tingkat Menengah pada Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri Kudus. *Edukasia: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1).
<https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.21043/edukasia.v10i1.791>
- Aotama, R. C., & Rosaltne, D. (2021). Dampak Sosial Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kawasan Wisata Kuliner Kota Tomohon. *Jurnal Socia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 18(1).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21831/socia.v18i1.37719>
- Baharuddin, A., Kasmita, M., & Salam, R. (2016). Analisis Kepuasan Wisatawan terhadap Daya Tarik Wisata Malioboro Kota Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Ad'ministrare*, 3(2).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.26858/ja.v3i2.2571>
- Bappeda, P. D. I. Y. (2022). *Data Dasar Pariwisata*.
- Cahya, G. A., Mahendra, Y. K. D., & Damanik, I. I. (2017). Malioboro as a Value of Special District of Yogyakarta City. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 70.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/70/1/012055>
- Cambridge Dictionary. (2022). *Perception*.
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/perception>
- Dinas Pariwisata, K. Y. (2019). *Malioboro Yogyakarta*. pariwisata.jogjakota.go.id
- Dinas Pariwisata, K. Y. (2020). *Kajian Jumlah Kunjungan Wisata Kota Yogyakarta Tahun 2020*. Dinas Pariwisata.
- Galbiati, R., Henry, E., Jacquemet, N., & Lobeck, M. (2021). How Laws Affect The Perception of Norms: Empirical Evidence from The Lockdown. *PLoS ONE*, 16(9).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0256624>
- Hafsah, & Yusuf. (2019). Dampak Kepariwisata dan Pergeseran Nilai Sosial Budaya di Batu Layar, Kecamatan Batu Layar. *Jurnal Civius Pendidikan Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan*, 7(1). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31764/civicus.v0i0.853>
- Karuniawan, M. H., Sukma, A. P., & Kurniawan, E. D. (2015). Analisis Dampak Sosial Ekonomi Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL), Studi PKL di Gelanggang Olah Raga (GOR) Kabupaten Sidoarjo. *JKMP*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21070/jkmp.v3i1.184>
- Kastanakis, M. N., & Voyer, B. G. (2014). The Effect of Culture on Perception and Cognition: A Conceptual Framework. *Journal of Business Research*, 67(4), 425–433.
<https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2013.03.028>
- Listyana, R., & Hartono, Y. (2015). Persepsi dan Sikap Masyarakat terhadap Penanggalan Jawa dalam Penentuan Waktu Pernikahan (Studi Kasus Desa Jonggrang Kecamatan Barat Kabupaten Magetan Tahun 2013). *Jurnal Agastya*, 5(1).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.25273/ajsp.v5i01.898>
- Murniatmo, G., Tashadi, Muryantoro, H., Taryati, & Suyami. (1994). *Dampak Pengembangan Pariwisata terhadap Kehidupan Sosial Budaya Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta*. Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, Direktorat Jenderal Kebudayaan.
- Prasetya, M. A., & Fauziah, L. (2016). Dampak Sosial Ekonomi Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kecamatan Buduran Kabupaten Sidoarjo. *JKMP2*, 4(2).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21070/jkmp.v4i2.691>

- Prayuda, A. S., Priyo, E., Salsabila, L., & Kasiwi, A. (2020). Persepsi Wisatawan terhadap Penataan Kawasan Pedestrian Malioboro. *Jurnal Nasional Pariwisata*, 12(1).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22146/jnp.52958>
- Putra, Y. S. (2016). Theoretical Review: Teori Perbedaan Generasi. *Among Makarti*, 9(18), 123–134.
- Rukmorini, R., & Anugrahanto, N. C. (2022). *Dua Sisi Wajah Baru Jalan Malioboro*.
<https://www.kompas.id/baca/nusantara/2022/05/09/ketika-pengunjung-menguasai-malioboro>
- Saryani. (2015). Hubungan Pariwisata dan Perubahan Sosial Masyarakat di Provinsi Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Media Wisata*, 13(2).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.36276/mws.v13i2.228>
- Sugiyono. (2018). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Suharsimi, A. (2006). *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Rineka Cipta.
- Susanto, H. (2022). *Wajah Baru Malioboro Tanpa PKL Bikin Wisatawan Nyaman*.
<https://www.detik.com/jateng/wisata/d-5940595/wajah-baru-malioboro-tanpa-pkl-bikin-wisatawan-nyaman>
- Suwandi, B. D. (2008). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Rineka Cipta.

About the Author:

Chief Researcher
Marista Christina Shally Kabelen <i>Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia</i>
Researcher Member
-