The Incorporation of Citizenship Competency in EFL Learning Materials for Senior High School Students

Fanisa Salma Maida
English Language Education Study Program
Universitas Negeri Jakarta
Jakarta, Indonesia
fanisasm@gmail.com

Ratna Dewanti
English Language Education Study Program
Universitas Negeri Jakarta
Jakarta, Indonesia
rdewanti@unj.ac.id

Abstract

This study aims at analysing the extent to which citizenship competency was incorporated and describing ways citizenship competency was incorporated in EFL learning materials for senior high school students. A content analysis was used to analyse 53 EFL learning materials from four public senior high school teachers in East Jakarta. The findings show that citizenship competency was incorporated in most learning materials except for three learning materials, indicated by the none fulfilment of the indicators. However, the indicators were fulfilled in other learning materials, resulting in all factors of citizenship competency being incorporated, with skills as the highest in incorporation (34.2%), followed by citizenship knowledge (33.6%), and attitudes and values (32.2%). Citizenship competency was incorporated through the incorporation of the significant topics, opportunities to apply and develop citizenship skills, and opportunities related to citizenship attitudes and values. Since the types and forms of learning materials were varied, citizenship competency was incorporated in varied ways. These findings are expected to aid teachers in choosing and incorporating citizenship competency in their learning materials.

Keywords: Citizenship competency, EFL learning materials, senior high school students

INTRODUCTION

Living in the 21st century poses potential and challenges for education. The world is changing and interconnected more than ever, allowing knowledge to be available everywhere (Malik, 2018) and increasing opportunities for socio-cultural exchanges of people from diverse countries and backgrounds (Díaz, 2017). Within that context, education encounters two challenges, which are getting benefits of the transformation in improving educational practices and equipping students with skills that are critically important for today and future lives. Skills needed to grasp the 21st century are identified as 21st-century skills. (Griffin, Care, & McGaw, 2012). The Assessment and Teaching of 21st-century skills (ATC21S) researchers classified the skills into four groups: *ways of thinking*, *ways of working*, *tools for working*, and *living in the world* (Griffin, Care, & McGaw, 2012).

One of the skills classified as 'living in the world' skills is citizenship. It refers to students' capacity to act as active, informed, and responsible citizens for local and global communities based on the understanding that

one country's context could differ from another (Binkley, et al., 2012), awareness of diversity, appropriate interactions, and global issues (OECD, 2018). Citizenship is mentioned in all theoretical frameworks for 21st-century skills, including Partnership for 21st-century skills (P21), enGauge, ATC21S, National Educational Technology Standards (NETS/ISTE), and related international studies and recommendations from the European Union, Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), and United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO))(Voogt & Roblin, 2010), underlying the importance of educating students to be citizens of the world. Citizenship is also identified by Fullan, Quinn, and McEachen (2017) in their *deep learning* initiative as *key future qualities*. It complements *character education*, *communication*, *critical thinking* and *problem-solving, collaboration, creativity*, and *imagination*, which are further coined as 6Cs or six global competencies. Greater prominence has been placed on citizenship as it becomes a goal of education by 2030, notably goal 4.7 of the Sustainable Development Agenda(UNESCO, 2015). It was highlighted that education should focus on both cognitive and non-cognitive factors of learning to achieve the goal, which implies that students need to develop knowledge, skills, and attitudes related to citizenship. The term 'competency' is then preferable to 'skills' to describe the multi-layered dimensions of citizenship: *knowledge*, *skills*, *attitudes*, *and values*(European Union, 2019; OECD, 2018; Fullan, Quinn, & McEachen, 2017; Binkley, et al., 2012).

In recent times, several researchers have shown a great deal of interest in observing curricula and programs initiated for citizenship competency (Reynolds, MacQueen, & Ferguson-Patrick, 2019; Shi, Chong, & Li, 2019; Göğebakan-Yildiz, 2018; Díaz, 2017; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017; Larsen & Searle, 2017; Aktas, Pitts, Richards, & Silova, 2016). For example, a systematic textual analysis was intended to explore how global citizenship was mentioned in three primary school curriculum areas in Australia: English, mathematics, science, the arts, humanities and social sciences (HASS), English, and science. Findings of studies indicated that citizenship competency could be incorporated within the curricula and beyond. Moreover, the incorporation of citizenship competency within the curricula can be done in three ways: *cross-curricular theme*, *separate subjects*, and *other existing subjects*. Studies of citizenship in higher education enrich those findings that the programs initiated to develop citizenship competency were conducted beyond the curriculum through outside classroom activities (Kishino & Takahashi, 2019; Aktas, Pitts, Richards, & Silova, 2016). Students were facilitated with 'global experiences' such as study abroad and international service-learning. However, in primary and secondary education, citizenship is commonly incorporated into the existing subjects (Reynolds, MacQueen, & Ferguson-Patrick, 2019; Zúñiga, Cárdenas, Martínez, & Valledor, 2019; Díaz, 2017; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017).

In the Indonesian context of education, citizenship has been reflected as a goal of the curriculum. The rationale of incorporating citizenship in teaching practices of the existing subjects is in line with the expected outcomes of the revised Kurikulum 2013 – students as active citizens who understand their roles and responsibilities in contributing to their communities, nation, and global (Kemendikbud, 2018). Besides, a shift to a student-centred learning approach as one of the curriculum's qualities results in a positive learning environment in promoting competency (Khalil, 2019; Fullan, Hill, & Rincón-Gallardo, 2017). As a compulsory subject in secondary education, the study of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) is expected to facilitate students with citizenship learning experiences. Díaz (2017) argued that the EFL classroom appears to be an ideal place to foster citizenship competency in students due to its possibility of allowing them to explore diverse identities and cultures. It is also through the study of English that students acquire skills such as critical analysis, perspective-taking, and communication with a prospect of students as 'potential or future citizens' (Reynolds, MacQueen, & Ferguson-Patrick, 2019).

To put the idea into action, teachers need to ensure that teaching and learning in the classroom are effective. In that way, the provision of pertinent learning materials to support citizenship learning becomes a prerequisite. Careful consideration needs to be put in constructing related topics as they significantly contribute to the competency (OECD, 2018). On top of that, the transmission of all the inseparable dimensions of citizenship competency should not be overlooked (European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017). Thus, the learning materials should offer opportunities to foster knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values related to citizenship. Learning materials are varied in form; textbooks are one of them. Shi (2019) found that the dimensions of

citizenship competency that are generally included in civic education textbooks for three emerging Chinese societies – China, Hongkong, and Macao – are knowledge of local cultural characteristics, global context, values, and attitudes needed to be a good citizen. However, citizenship is taught as a separate subject.

From the above review, very few studies have been conducted on the incorporation of citizenship competency in EFL learning materials of the existing subject or compulsory subject at the secondary school level in Indonesia. Thus, to fill the gap, this study aimed to focus on the incorporation of citizenship competency in EFL learning materials for senior high school students in East Jakarta. The results of this study are expected to give significant contributions in theoretical ways as a reference for future researchers and education stakeholders to promote citizenship competency and in practical ways for teachers and student teachers to raise awareness on the incorporation of citizenship competency in EFL learning materials.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study utilized the qualitative research approach, which allowed the study to provide in-depth investigation and consider actions, decisions, perceptions, and behaviour within groups in natural settings (Creswell, 2014; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). Furthermore, the content analysis was carried out to make replicable and valid inferences from texts (or other meaningful matter such *as artworks, images, maps, signs, symbols, and numerical descriptions*) to the contexts of their use (Krippendorff, 2004, p. 18). However, in line with the scope of the research, given that the study was carried out based on EFL learning materials for senior high school students of public schools in East Jakarta, no generalization can be made.

The data of this study were sentences, utterances, and information indicating citizenship competency incorporated in EFL learning materials for senior high school students. There were 53 learning materials used in this study, collected from four EFL teachers from four public senior high schools. The schools were chosen as they showed a great variety of learning materials. The learning materials included 16 learning materials for 10th grade, 11 learning materials for 11th grade, 25 learning materials for 12th grade, and one learning material without any grade specification, but intended for senior high school student's level. The types of learning materials included 38 visual materials, 14 audio-visual materials, and one combination of visual, auditory, and audio-visual material in the forms of textbooks, e-modules, PowerPoints, worksheets, handouts, learning websites, academic lecture recordings, videos from YouTube, and Powtoon. The data belonging to the visual learning materials were sentences and information in the form of statements, questions, commands, lyrics, captions, and pictures indicating citizenship competency. The data belonging to the auditory learning material were utterances indicating citizenship competency. Moreover, the data belonging to the audio-visual learning materials were utterances, questions, and information indicating citizenship competency.

The indicators of citizenship competency as the framework of reference, derived from the concepts of citizenship competency and the characteristics of citizenship learning in various sources, were used to analyse the data. The indicators also represent the ways to incorporate the citizenship competency in learning materials by respecting the four inseparable factors, including knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. *The Extent to Which Citizenship Competency is Incorporated in EFL Learning Materials for Senior High School Students*

Based on the EFL learning materials analysis, citizenship competency was incorporated in most learning materials for senior high school students, except for three learning materials which indicated no fulfilment of the indicators. By having 14 indicators and 53 learning materials, the total of indicators was 742. Out of 742 indicators, 116 were fulfilled. The overall number of indicators' fulfilment, percentage, and the related knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values of each indicator is shown in the following table.

No.	Indicators	Frequency	Percentage	Related Factors

1	Incorporates cultural and societal diversity themes(OECD, 2019; Díaz, 2017; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017; Jean-Sigur, Bell, & Kim, 2015; Binkley, et al., 2012)	7	6%	• Understand cultural and societal diversity • Respect for cultural and societal diversity
2	Incorporates key ideas and concepts related to universal values(Zúñiga, Cárdenas, Martínez, & Valledor, 2019; OECD, 2019; UNESCO, 2015; UNESCO, 2014)	10	9%	• Understand universal values • Respect and support universal values
3	Incorporates environmental issues(OECD, 2019; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017; UNESCO, 2015; Jean-Sigur, Bell, & Kim, 2015; C21 Canada (Canadians for 21st Century Learning and Innovation), 2012)	6	5%	• Understand environmental issues
4	Offers additional tasks or activities related to taking care of future generations and taking responsibility for the environment(European Union, 2019; OECD, 2018; UNESCO, 2015)	3	3%	• Support environmental sustainability and be responsible for the environment
5	Incorporates contemporary issues or events – local and global(Garcia-Esteban, 2020; Ministry of Education Singapore, 2020; European Union, 2019; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017; Jean-Sigur, Bell, & Kim, 2015)	11	9%	• Understand contemporary issues or events
6	Incorporates socio-economic and interdependence topic(OECD, 2019)	2	2%	• Understand socio-economic development and interdependence
7	Incorporates a focus to appropriately communicate according to the age and status of the interlocutor, purpose, and context(OECD, 2019; Díaz, 2017)	36	31%	• Understand differences in communication • Communication skills
8	Utilizes technology that allows students to connect with people from different backgrounds, origins, and cultures(Jean-Sigur, Bell, & Kim, 2015; UNESCO, 2014)	8	7%	• Social skills • Respect and tolerance when listening to others
9	Incorporates instructions, tasks, or activities to reason with, analyse, and evaluate information and sources(OECD, 2019; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017; Binkley, et al., 2012)	7	6%	• Thinking critically
10	Incorporates discussion and debate approach(OECD, 2019; Díaz, 2017; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017)	7	6%	• Perspective-taking • Respect and tolerance when listening to others • Participative

11	Offers tasks that encourage individual students to give viewpoints about a topic or idea(Díaz, 2017)	6	5%	• Perspective-taking
12	Offers opportunity to recognise conflict and seek for solution(OECD, 2019)	4	3%	• Conflict management and resolution • Problem-solving skills • Decision-making skills • Empathy
13	Incorporates group work or cooperative learning(Ministry of Education Singapore, 2020; OECD, 2019; European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017)	7	6%	• Collaboration or act collaboratively • Social skills • Respect and tolerance when listening to others • Participative
14	Offers opportunity for students to decide their learning(European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2017)	2	2%	• Participative
Total		116	100%	

Table 1: The Fulfilment of Citizenship Competency Indicators in the EFL Learning Materials

Each of the 50 learning materials presented 1 to 11 characteristics of learning material that incorporate citizenship competency. In general, as presented in Table 1, the learning materials predominantly *incorporate a focus to appropriately communicate according to the age and status of the interlocutor, purpose, and context*, resulting in a big gap to other indicators. The number of learning materials that *incorporate socio-economic and interdependence topics* and *offer opportunities for students to decide their learning* appeared to be the lowest. Moreover, three learning materials which were in the form of PowerPoint did not fulfil any indicator at all. The EFL learning materials in the form of a textbook fulfilled almost all of the 14 indicators while other forms of learning materials fulfilled half of the indicators. This happens due to the topic carried out in each learning material, in which textbooks contain five or more topics, while such materials as a worksheet, PowerPoint, learning website, and video usually contain one topic. Thus, the textbooks appeared to incorporate citizenship competency in varied ways, reflected through the fulfilment of the indicators in the three textbooks analysed in this study.

However, all of the textbooks did not incorporate contemporary issues or events – local and global – which is a significant topic in citizenship competency. It is because textbooks are published at a particular time and are usually used for more than one school term. For instance, one of the textbooks was published in 2014 and is still used on the second school term in 2021. Accordingly, textbooks rarely incorporate contemporary issues or events that happened at the time students used them for learning. As a result, a combination of various types and forms of learning materials were used by teachers to complement one another in the learning process. Thus, by compiling all of the available EFL learning materials for senior high schools for this study, all indicators were present, indicating that all factors, including knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values of citizenship competency, were incorporated.

1) Knowledge of Citizenship Incorporated in the EFL Learning Materials

The knowledge of citizenship incorporated in the EFL learning materials for senior high school students covered cultural and societal diversity, universal values, environmental issues, contemporary issues or events, socio-economic and interdependence, and communication differences. The knowledge related to cultural and societal diversity was presented in varied themes, including accents, food, drink, celebrations, culture and society of countries, languages of different communities or regions, the life of different communities, races, stereotypes, and traditions. The following quotations illustrated some of those findings.

"For me, a step on ice is a potential disaster … Norwegian hardly falls on ice … They even run races on the ice and win competitions! Can you imagine? … I remember you telling me stories about the place where all rivers poured their waters, in our language, gungwa (the water to quench all thirst). It is just that, and Norwegian are people of the sea … According to Norwegians, if you don't eat fish, like me, you're supposed to be miserable …" (LM 17, in *Text*).

"… Akycha and his people are part of the Inuit community. Most of them still live a very traditional life, a life that makes them dependent on hunting seals and whales. Some of them also live off the reindeer they keep. The Inuit are indigenous people of the Arctic Circle, which means they've lived here for so long that they feel the land is theirs … Temperatures are low during most of the year and summers are short, which means that plants can only grow for a few weeks every year …" (LM 41, in *Text*).

"Thinking about your own country, or a region of your country. Do people from other places have fixed ideas about the people who live there? … Do you think there is any truth in the stereotypes of your country or region?" (LM 41, in *Task*)

Another knowledge of citizenship incorporated in the EFL learning materials for senior high school was universal values. Key ideas and concepts related to a culture of peace and non-violence, and love for humanity, including empowering and helping others, were considerably incorporated in the EFL learning materials. The findings of this study showed a different finding from Zúñiga, Cárdenas, Martínez, and Valledor (2019), which revealed that knowledge of universal values related to human rights was mainly addressed. However, this study also found key ideas and concepts related to human rights, including rights of mobility and education rights, and citizenship duties such as voting. Other than those universal values, key ideas and concepts related to social justice, a national and international organization that support the values, non-racism, and healthcare were also present in the learning materials. See the following excerpts:

"Africans want to be paid a living wage. Africans want to perform work which they are capable of doing, and not work which the government declares them to be capable of. We want to be allowed to live where we obtain work, and not be endorsed out of an area because we were not born there … I have fought against white domination, and I have fought against black domination. I have cherished the ideal of a democratic and free society in which all persons live together in harmony and with equal opportunities." (LM 17, in *Text*)

"I am here to speak up for the right of education of every child. I want education for the sons and the daughters of all the extremists especially the Taliban. I do not even hate the Talib who shot me. Even if there is a gun in my hand and he stands in front of me. I would not shoot him … This is the philosophy of non-violence that I have learnt from Gandhi Jee, Bacha Khan and Mother Teresa. And this is the forgiveness that I have learnt from my mother and father. This is what my soul is telling me, be peaceful and love everyone …" (LM 17, in *Text*)

The learning materials also appeared to incorporate varied environmental issues, involving environmental impact resulting from different factors, natural resources, natural disasters, wildlife, environmental problem, and waste. The following quotations illustrated some of those findings.

"Vocabulary:

6. … carbon footprint

Definition:

the calculation of how much CO_2 a person, company, organisation, etc. produces, which is used to measure the environmental damage they cause." (LM 9, in *Task*)

"Heard of Virunga? It's Africa's oldest national park, and a treasured World Heritage Site. Rainforest, volcanoes, rare and beautiful wildlife – Virunga has it all. People who live and work there know it's a very special place. But Virunga is at risk of becoming Africa's newest oil field …We believe oil exploration would bring a new and unacceptable level of risk for Virunga's environment and communities. That's why we need to draw the line." (LM 17, in *Text*)

Another citizenship knowledge is related to contemporary issues or events. In this study, the issues and events considered contemporary happened during the time the learning materials were used, or those students still can relate up to now. The study took place during the COVID-19 pandemic; thus, most learning materials appeared to incorporate issues related to it. However, the emphasis was varied, including vaccines, regulation for the learning processes, virtual learning or learning from home, and changes and challenges in agriculture. Moreover, contemporary issues related to Indonesian education, 21st-century classroom, work from home and the idea of telecommuting, online shop, and *Hari Krida* were also present in the learning materials. The following are some of the incorporations.

Poster of event related to current issue – COVID-19 held by Kemendikbud RI: "*Saksikan Pengumuman, Penyesuaian Kebijakan Pembelajaran di Masa Pandemi COVID-19*" (LM 2, in *Picture*)

Infographic of "*Daftar Prioritas Penerima Vaksin COVID-19 dari Pemerintah*" from CNN Indonesia. It contains information of the government's plan and target: "*Pemerintah akan memproduksi vaksin virus corona yang menyasar 102,45 juta orang pada 2021 … Rencananya vaksin akan didistribusikan pada tahap pertama mulai Januari 2021 … Garda Terdepan (tenagamedis) target 1.317.656 orang…*" (LM 4, in *Picture*)

The EFL learning materials also appeared to incorporate knowledge of socio-economic and interdependence, involving topics related to Omnibus Law and online commerce, which influence local and global economic development. The following excerpts illustrate those findings.

Picture of news preview: "*DPR mengesahkan Omnibus Law RUU Cipta Kerja menjadi Undang-Undang melalui Rapat Paripurna, Senin (5/10)*" (LM 4, in *Picture*)

"…We used to buy our goods in traditional shops, on the high street or in department stores. Now, customers are increasingly buying online, where they can order whatever they want directly to their door with a click of a mouse. One in seven sales are now made online and studies suggest that by 2021, global online retail will reach an enormous US\$4.8 trillion…" (LM 9, in *Text*)

Furthermore, knowledge of differences in communication was incorporated by focusing on communication according to the interlocutor, purpose, and context to have adequate and appropriate communication. The learning materials directed students to be aware of communication styles, conversational strategies, suitable expressions, and levels of formality. Those findings were in line with Díaz (2017) that allowing students to recognise those factors helps them be aware of differences in communication in a given social and cultural context. The following excerpts support those findings:

"Analyse in what ways the conversation is not working well and why this has come about…" (LM 17, in *Task*)

"Narrator: Anna, this is the moment to show you're willing to help.
Anna: Yes!
Narrator: Use phrases like 'Is there anything I can do?' 'Let me help!' or, to be more informal, you can say, 'Can I give you a hand?' or 'Give me a shout if you need anything!'
Anna: Right.

Narrator: Go on!" (LM 19, in *Explanation*)

"The wedding service is a legal ceremony and as such must be accompanied by certain formal statements, for example *Does anyone know of any just cause or impediment why these two people should not be joined together in marriage? I now pronounce you husband and wife* … Formal 'set pieces' of language are also present in the social side of the reception: there are speeches and toasts to the married couple, and the cutting of the cake … for example *Ladies and gentlemen, please join me in raising your glasses to Ndyana and Niall, Mr. and Mrs.Sorour; the bride and groom are about to cut the cake.*" (LM 17, in *Explanation*)

"… Both Chris and the interviewer are young, and use colloquialisms (*rocked up, awesome*) which are familiar to the audience who, as a social group, are likely to be of a broadly similar age …" (LM 17, in *Text*).

2) Skills of Citizenship Incorporated in the EFL Learning Materials

Referring to the analysis of the indicators, the EFL learning materials for senior high school students appeared to incorporate cognitive skills, non-cognitive skills, and the combination of the two skills. The first group of cognitive skills incorporated in the learning materials was thinking critically, including critical reception of information or sources, reasoning with information or sources, and evaluating information or sources. The incorporation of those skills in the learning materials can be seen in the following excerpt:

"*Perkuat pidato dengan argument dan data relevan yang mendukung*" (LM 4, in *Task*).

In order to write a speech, one of the steps that students need to do is providing arguments and relevant data. That step encourages students to accept information critically, analyse, and evaluate information and sources to provide argument and relevant data to support their speech. Other incorporations of critical reception, reasoning, and evaluating information or sources can be seen in the following quotations.

"In what way is this a good answer?" (LM 17, in *Task*)

"How could this part of the response be improved?" (LM 17, in *Task*)

"Think back to the novel/short stories you have read and try to determine why you enjoyed reading some as opposed to others. What was it about the character/s, the story itself, or the imaginative world the author created?" (LM 33, in *Instruction*)

Other cognitive skills incorporated in the EFL learning materials for senior high school students were problem-solving and decision-making skills. In relation to those factors, conflict management and resolution skills were also incorporated. The following quotations illustrate those findings.

"What makes you feel nervous? How can you calm your nerves?" (LM 11, in *Question*)

"I have very bad eyesight and need to wear glasses. Because of this, some people at school call me names. I tried not to let it bother me too much, but the problem is that it happens quite often. I've always enjoyed school and had lots of friends, but I'm starting to hate going there. My grades also getting worse and some of the teachers have said they're disappointed with me … Can you help?
Lara, Ipwich// Write a reply to Lara (150-200 words). Say what you think she should do." (LM 41, in *Text* and *Task*)
"Work in pairs. Discuss these questions.
1 What other famous crimes do you know of [text cropped]?

2 What do you think should be done to stop cybercrime?" (LM 41, in *Task*)

Skills to act collaboratively were also incorporated in the EFL learning materials. As students will have to work with other people, social skills such as communication skills and interacting with people of different backgrounds, cultures, and perspectives were also interconnected. Those findings are illustrated in the following excerpts.

> "Compare your draft with a friend. Have you both: changed the viewpoint? used material from the original extract? written in a style that matches that of similar reviews? Mark up each other's drafts and then rewrite, improving where needed." (LM 17, in *Instruction*)

> "Work in pairs. Think of three reasons why the parents of these teenagers are right." (LM 41, in *Instruction*)

The EFL learning materials also appeared to incorporate communication skills with an emphasis on appropriately communicating according to the interlocutor's status and age, purpose, and context. Besides that, networking and interacting with people of different backgrounds, cultures, and perspectives were also incorporated. Those findings can be seen in the following excerpts.

> "Scenario: You are in group of 3 with specific role for each, at a school seminar. Please conduct an inspiring talk show in the seminar with the topic Inspiring new paradigm for a better school in 5-7 minutes. Show your enthusiasm in choosing "powerful words" and delivering your brilliant ideas. Persuade audiences with your arguments. Relate your topic with the trend hobbies and interests today. Pay attention to intonation, pace, voice volume, eye contact, gestures and speaking style also linguistic features used (grammar, part of speech, etc.)" (LM 10, in *Task*)

> "You have received an email from an English-speaking penfriend … Write your email in 140-190 words." (LM 41, in *Task*)

> "… *We need the best education because*

> S1: [best education] is an education that makes someone become professional, which means having good knowledge, skills, and attitudes.

> S3: A good education as an education that is able to maximise each individual's potential. Effective enough to ensure that they will pursue their dreams as well as contribute to a better world …" (LM 3, in *Utterances of a Video*)

Moreover, the learning materials also incorporate perspective-taking skills. The following excerpts support those findings:

> "Do you agree that community service is better than prison for some crimes?" (LM 8, in *Instruction*)

> "How important is it to you to speak English? Explain your reasons to others in a group debate." (LM 17, in *Instruction*)

3) Attitudes and Values of Citizenship Incorporated in the EFL Learning Materials

Attitudes and values related to respect for cultural and societal diversity, respect and support universal values, support environmental sustainability and responsibility for the environment, respect and tolerance when listening to others, empathy, and participation were present in the data. Most capacities are interrelated

to understanding related knowledge and applying related skills. The following excerpts illustrate those findings.

> "Are there different accents in your class? Ask your fellow students to say the same word and use the IPA to show how it is pronounced. Try to represent the sound as precisely as possible." (LM 10, in *Task*)

> "Do you agree that community service is better than prison for some crimes?" (LM 8, in *Instruction*)

The initial excerpt indicates that the learning material incorporates knowledge of cultural and societal diversity. By encouraging students to recognise different accents, which indicates a socio-cultural identity of someone in their class and how it affects their fellow students in pronouncing words, they also need to respect the diversity. A similar analysis to the later excerpt, by having students apply their perspective-taking skills to discuss the issue in question, attitudes and values related to respect a different opinion, being willing to listen to and defend others, and being participative are interconnected. However, to what extent the attitudes and values were developed in students by acquiring the knowledge and applying the skills is not in the scope of this study.

Regardless of those findings, two capacities were presented explicitly in the EFL learning materials. Those were supporting environmental sustainability and being responsible for the environment, and being participative. Keep in mind that the student's participation is limited to participation in a classroom, such as deciding on their learning, coming up with their ideas, and selecting their sources to support their ideas and arguments. Those can be seen in the following quotations.

> "Do you shop online? How can online shopping's environmental impact be lessened?" (LM 9, in *Task*)

> "*A recycling charity in your area is very concerned about the amount of waste and household rubbish. Write an online campaign text aimed at parents to persuade them to think carefully about what they throw away. In your article, create a sense of optimism and belief in change.*" (LM 17, in *Task*)

> "Rather than complete a directed writing task on the same text, plan and write a response to extended writing task for a specific audience … If you are struggling to come up with the ideas, use this idea board – either at random (close your eyes and stick a pin in it!) or through choice." (LM 17, in *Task*)

To present the distribution of the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values of citizenship competency in the learning materials, however, the number of statements or information indicating the citizenship competency found in each indicator was considered. By referring to Table 4.2.1.1, keep in mind that each indicator may represent more than one factor of citizenship competency. *Indicator 1*, for instance, represents knowledge, attitude, and value of citizenship. On the other hand, *Indicator9* represents skills of citizenship. The following table shows the occurrences of statements or information in each indicator.

Indicators	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14
Factors	K AV	K AV	K	AV	K	K	K S	S AV	S	S AV	S	S	S AV	AV
Occurrences	32	21	14	3	16	2	206 24	1 14	19	112	41	8	92	5

Table 2: The Occurrences of Citizenship Competency of each Indicator in the EFL Learning Materials

For *Indicator 7* and *Indicator* 8, the occurrences were divided into each factor because the statements indicated different factor focus: 206 occurrences focused on knowledge of differences in communication while 24 occurrences focused on the communication skills according to the interlocutor, purpose, and context, and one occurrence focused on social skills while 14 occurrences focused on respecting and being tolerance when listening to others (i.e., different backgrounds, cultures, origins, and perspectives). Thus, there were 291 occurrences of knowledge, 297 occurrences of skills, and 279 occurrences of attitudes and values. Those findings indicate that citizenship skills were the highest in incorporation (34.2%), followed by citizenship knowledge (33.6%), attitudes and values (32.2%). Since there was no big gap between factors, the inseparable factors of citizenship competency were considered well distributed in the EFL learning materials for senior high school students.

B. Ways Citizenship Competency is Incorporated in EFL Learning Materials for Senior High School Students

Citizenship competency was incorporated in EFL learning materials through the incorporation of the significant topics, opportunities to apply and develop citizenship skills, and opportunities related to citizenship attitudes and values. They were incorporated in the visual, audio-visual, and the combination of visual, auditory, and audio-visual materials. Since there were varied learning material forms, the citizenship competency was incorporated in varied ways.

The EFL learning materials for senior high school students incorporated citizenship competency through the incorporation of cultural and societal diversity themes. The learning materials that presented those themes were in the form of PowerPoint, textbook, worksheet, and video from YouTube. They incorporated the themes frequently in the texts (18 occurrences) given to students. Other than that, the learning materials also incorporated the themes through the provision of activities (5 occurrences), tasks (4 occurrences), photos (2 occurrences), conversation – as reflected through the utterances in the video (1 occurrence) and answer example (1 occurrence) addressing or encouraging students to recognise cultural and societal differences that significantly contributes to students' understanding of diverse culture and society and respect for diversity.

The learning materials also incorporated citizenship competency by incorporating key ideas and concepts related to universal values in textbooks, handouts, worksheets, a PowerPoint, and videos from YouTube. The universal values were materialized in the texts (9 occurrences), tasks (4 occurrences), questions (2 occurrences), activities (2 occurrences), a picture of campaign poster (1 occurrence), and a song lyric (1 occurrence). As for the audio-visual materials (i.e., videos), the universal values were reflected through the utterances (2 occurrences). One of the videos used by a teacher shows someone who wants to be kind to as many people as possible by helping them out. The ideas related to universal values were reflected in the video through the conversation and narration.

Moreover, the knowledge of environmental issues was available in the textbooks, worksheets, and a handout. The issues were incorporated in the texts (9 occurrences), tasks (4 occurrences), questions (2 occurrences), a conversation (1 occurrence), and a group of pictures (1 occurrence). There were three pictures showing environmental problems on the earth; however, they were grouped in one of the textbook activities, thus counted as one occurrence. The pictures included a picture of a flood, pollution caused by factories, and rubbish on the street.

In addition, the learning materials also incorporated citizenship competency through offering the additional tasks related to taking care of future generations and taking responsibility for the environment. The learning materials were textbooks and a worksheet. In total, there were three occurrences in the learning materials. The tasks encouraged students to take care of future generations and take responsibility for the environment by seeking solutions to lessen the environmental impact of online shopping. Students were also encouraged to write an article or campaign for the given environmental issue persuading households to think about their waste and showing an optimistic attitude to change. The task also encouraged students to talk about doing something for the environmental problem given as a topic.

The learning materials also appeared to incorporate citizenship competency by incorporating contemporary issues or events. The learning materials included PowerPoint, handout, worksheet, video from YouTube, and academic lecture recording. There were four audio-visual materials, so the contemporary issues or events were mainly incorporated in the utterances (5 occurrences) mentioning the recent issues or events during the time the learning materials were used. Besides, the issues or events were also incorporated through the provision of pictures (4 occurrences), mind map topic examples showing disadvantages and issues related to learning from home (3 occurrences), texts (2 occurrences), a question (1 occurrence), and an answer example (1 occurrence).

It was also found that the learning materials incorporated socio-economic and interdependence topics, available in a PowerPoint and a worksheet. The topics were incorporated in different ways: through the provision of a picture (1 occurrence) and a text (1 occurrence) addressing related areas of the topic. To illustrate how the topic was incorporated, one occurrence will be described further. In the text, the first paragraph described how technology created a whole new platform that allows the customer to shop online. Though there were a few occurrences compared to other citizenship topics, students can further explore the addressed areas and how they contribute to economic development.

The last significant topic related to citizenship competency is differences in communication. The EFL learning materials appeared to incorporate a focus to appropriately communicate according to the age and status of the interlocutor, purpose, and context. That finding was also interrelated to how communication skills were incorporated into the learning materials. This was present in PowerPoints, handouts, worksheets, e-modules, textbooks, learning websites, Powtoon, videos from YouTube, and academic lecture recordings. The knowledge was mostly incorporated through explanations (114 occurrences) and tasks (53 occurrences). It was also incorporated through the utterances (13 occurrences) found in the audio-visual materials. For instance, in one of the audio-visual materials (i.e., a video from YouTube) about expressing needs and feelings, each section of emotion and feeling was divided by revealing the themes before the conversation happened. The narrator in the video made an utterance such as "*Happy*". That will direct students' attention to the expressions used for expressing happiness when listening and reading to the conversation made by the actors in the video. In addition, the knowledge was also incorporated through the provision of exercises or practices (9 occurrences), questions (8 occurrences), texts (3 occurrences), instructions (3 occurrences), and activities (3 occurrences). However, the skills were mainly incorporated through the provision of tasks (15 occurrences), followed by explanations (7 occurrences), and exercises or practices (2 occurrences).

Besides, citizenship competency was incorporated by utilizing technology that allows students to connect with people from different backgrounds, origins, and cultures, present in videos from YouTube, textbooks, a PowerPoint, and a worksheet. From that finding, the utilized technology was either directly used by the teacher or stated in the students' learning materials. The videos from YouTube were the technology directly used by the teachers. In one of the videos, students from different schools around Indonesia share their dreams and thoughts on the need for the best education, the importance of learning, and the reasons to be passionate about learning. The video allows students in the classroom to connect with other students from varied backgrounds as they can hear, relate, and learn different perspectives from them. In total, four videos had a similar description. On the other hand, the technology was also meant to be used by the students as stated in the activities (4 occurrences), instruction (1 occurrence), and task (1 occurrence), and as students' further research (3), further reading (1 occurrence), and further watching and reading (1 occurrence). The technology included search engines on the internet, links to websites, and e-mail. The utilization of technology, such as e-mail, allows students to connect with people from different backgrounds, origins, and cultures as they are encouraged to use it to send a replied e-mail.

The EFL learning materials for senior high school students also incorporated citizenship competency by incorporating instructions and tasks that encourage students to reason with, analyse, and evaluate information and sources. The learning materials were in the form of PowerPoint, textbook, e-module, and academic lecture recording. The tasks (13 occurrences) and instruction (6) encouraged students to reason, analyse, and evaluate information in different sources and forms of media, including infographics, commentaries, a video, a sample

response, a speech, a transcript, sources on the internet, novels or short stories, cover letters, pictures, captions, a graphic or chart, and newspapers.

Moreover, it appeared that the learning materials incorporate citizenship competency by incorporating discussion and debate approaches. The learning materials were textbooks, worksheets, and a PowerPoint. Discussion and debate approaches were incorporated in the instructions (101 occurrences), tasks (8 occurrences), and activities (3 occurrences). The discussion was varied in terms of the participants: in pairs (i.e., with a partner, with a chair-mate), in a group of three students, and with other groups. There were also unspecified participant numbers, such as discussing with friends, in a small group, and unspecified participants of the discussion, indicating that the learning materials assign students to have a discussion without further description on who will be the participants.

In order to encourage the individual student to give a viewpoint about an idea or topic without influence from others, tasks are assigned, with a total of 35 occurrences available in the PowerPoints, textbooks, a video from YouTube, and a worksheet. In addition, the task was also found to be incorporated through the formulation of questions (6 occurrences) assigning students to share their opinion.

The citizenship competency was also incorporated in the learning materials by offering the opportunity for students to recognise conflict and seek a solution. It is available in the textbooks, a worksheet, and a video from YouTube in the form of tasks (5 occurrences), questions (2 occurrences), and a text (1 occurrence). In specific, the text was a letter that came along with the related task. The text was explicitly used to address the problem or conflict, while the related task encouraged the students to give solutions or advice by writing a reply letter to the sender.

Besides, the learning materials incorporated citizenship competency by incorporating group work or cooperative learning. The learning materials included textbooks, PowerPoint, a worksheet, and an academic lecture recording, reflected in the instructions (76 occurrences), tasks (13 occurrences), and activities (3 occurrences). The goal of the group work or cooperative learning were varied, including talking about texts or ideas, refining script and presentation performance, giving feedback on each other work, having short dialogues, role-playing, looking at sources, comparing ideas, identifying information, deciding on ideas, searching for sources, and answering questions.

As the final finding on ways citizenship competency was incorporated in EFL learning materials for senior high school students, it appeared that the learning materials offered the opportunity for students to decide their learning. They included a PowerPoint and a textbook by providing tasks (4 occurrences) and an activity (1 occurrence). Students were allowed to select sources according to their needs to support their arguments for speech, select tasks to complete, and come up with their ideas.

Based on those findings, knowledge of citizenship competency was mostly incorporated through the provision of explanations (116 occurrences) followed by tasks (65 occurrences). In contrast, song, conversation, and students' further reading and watching rarely incorporated citizenship competency, indicated by one occurrence. Skills of citizenship competency were mostly incorporated through the provision of instructions (183 occurrences) and tasks (90 occurrences), while text (1 occurrence) was rarely incorporated in the skills. Furthermore, citizenship attitudes and values were mostly incorporated through the provision of instructions (178 occurrences) and tasks (36 occurrences) and rarely incorporated in conversation, answer example, picture, song, and students' further reading, indicated by one occurrence. In that case, the task was incorporated in the EFL learning materials for senior high school students for various factors of citizenship competency.

As described in the findings, the EFL learning materials incorporated citizenship competency, including the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values in varied ways. That finding supports findings in Zúñiga, Cárdenas, Martínez, and Valledor (2019) that the way of materialising knowledge differs from one teacher to another and complements their findings in terms of how skills, attitudes, and values were also materialized differently.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Most EFL learning materials for senior high school students incorporated citizenship competency. Even though the three learning materials did not incorporate citizenship competency, other learning materials complement them, resulting in all present indicators. That indicates that all factors of citizenship competency, including knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values, were incorporated. By considering the number of occurrences of the factors in each indicator, citizenship skills were found to be the highest in incorporation (34.2%), followed by citizenship knowledge (33.6%), attitudes and values (32.2%). However, there was no significant gap from one factor to another. Thus, the inseparable factors of citizenship competency were considered well distributed in the learning materials.

Citizenship competency was incorporated in EFL learning materials for senior high school students by incorporating the essential topics, opportunities to apply and develop citizenship skills, and opportunities related to citizenship attitudes and values. They were incorporated in all types of learning materials: visual, audio-visual, and the combination of visual, auditory, and audio-visual materials. Citizenship competency was incorporated in varied ways due to the varied learning material forms available in the study. Knowledge of citizenship competency was mostly incorporated through explanations (116 occurrences) followed by tasks (65 occurrences). Instructions (183 occurrences) and tasks (90 occurrences) were primarily used to incorporate skills of citizenship competency. Besides, citizenship attitudes and values were mostly incorporated through instructions (178 occurrences) and tasks (36 occurrences). Under those circumstances, the task was employed by teachers to incorporate various factors of citizenship competency in the EFL learning materials for senior high school students.

This study utilizes indicators that convey the characteristics of EFL learning materials for senior high school students that incorporate citizenship competency, analyses the extent to which citizenship competency was incorporated in the learning materials, and describes how citizenship competency is incorporated in the learning materials. Thus, serve as a reference for teachers to choose appropriate EFL learning materials and incorporate citizenship competency at the same time.

The scope of this study is limited to the incorporation of citizenship competency in EFL learning materials for senior high school students. Thus, it is recommended for future researchers to examine the incorporation of citizenship competency in EFL classroom interactions by employing classroom observations. With the methodology employed, this study is also subjected to a limitation in explaining how the learning materials significantly affect students' citizenship competency. Thus, it is also recommended to investigate the extent and positive connections between each factor of citizenship competency and their influence on students' citizenship competency outcomes. Then, compare the findings to the findings in this study.

REFERENCES

Aktas, F., Pitts, K., Richards, J. C., & Silova, I. (2016). Institutionalizing Global Citizenship: A Critical Analysis of Higher Education Programs and Curricula. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 1–16. doi:10.1177/1028315316669815

Binkley, M., Erstad, O., Herman, J., Raizen, S., Ripley, M., Miller-Ricci, M., & Rumble, M. (2012). Defining Twenty-First Century Skills. In P. Griffin, B. McGaw, & E. Care (Eds.), *Assessment and Teaching of 21st Century Skills* (pp. 17-66). Dordrecht: Springer Science+Business Media B.V. doi:10.1007/987-94-007-2324-5_2

C21 Canada (Canadians for 21st Century Learning and Innovation). (2012). *Shifting Minds: A 21st Century Vision of Public Education for Canada.* Retrieved from http://www.c21canada.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/11/Shifting-Minds-Revised.pdf

Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE.

Díaz, L. C. (2017). Citizenship Education and the EFL Standards: A Critical Reflection. *PROFILE, 19*(1), 155-168. doi:10.15446/profile.v19n1.55676

European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice. (2017). *Citizenship Education at School in Europe – 2017.* Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.

European Union. (2019). *Key Competences for Lifelong Learning.* Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. doi:10.2766/569540

Fullan, M., Hill, P., & Rincón-Gallardo, S. (2017). *Deep Learning: Shaking the Foundation.* Ontario, Canada: Fullan,M.,Quinn, J., & McEachen, J. Retrieved from http://npdl.global/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/npdl-case_study_3.pdf

Fullan, M., Quinn, J., & McEachen, J. (2017). *Deep Learning: Engage the World, Change the World.* SAGE Publications.

Garcia-Esteban, S. (2020). Telecollaboration for Civic Competence and SDG Development in FL Teacher Education. *European Journal of Education, 3*(3), 51-61.

Göğebakan-Yildiz, D. (2018). Global citizenship training program for teacher candidates. *Academic Journals Educational Research and Reviews, 13*(12), 436-446. doi:10.5897/ERR2018.3509

Griffin, P., Care, E., & McGaw, B. (2012). The Changing Role of Education and School. In P. Griffin, B. McGaw, & E. Care (Eds.), *Assessment and Teaching of 21st Century Skills* (pp. 1-16). Dordrecth: Springer Science+Business Media B. V. doi:10.1007/987-94-007-2324-5_1

Jean-Sigur, R., Bell, D., & Kim, Y. (2015). Building Global Awareness in Early Childhood Teacher Preparation Programs. *Childhood Education, 92*(1), 3-9. doi:10.1080/00094056.2016.1134235

Kemendikbud. (2018). *Salinan Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia Nomor 36 Tahun 2018 tentang Perubahan atas Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Nomor 59 Tahun 2014 tentang Kurikulum 2013 Sekolah Menengah Atas/Madrasah Aliyah.* Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.

Khalil, E. R. (2019). UNDERSTANDING AUTONOMY LEARNERS IN THE 6CS OF ELL. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences and Humanities, 9*(IV), 301-311. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/335753888_UNDERSTANDING_AUTONOMY_LEARNERS_IN_THE_6CS_OF_ELL

Kishino, H., & Takahashi, T. (2019). Global Citizenship Development: Effects of Study Abroad and Other Factors. *Journal of International Students, 9*(2), 535-559. doi:10.32674/jis.v9i2.390

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology* (2nd ed.). California: Sage Publications, Inc.

Larsen, M. A., & Searle, M. J. (2017). International service learning and critical global citizenship: A cross-case study of a Canadian teacher education alternative practicum. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 63*, 196-205. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.12.011

Malik, R. S. (2018). EDUCATIONAL CHALLENGES IN 21ST CENTURY AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT. *Journal of Sustainable Development Education and Research, 2*(1), 9-20.

Ministry of Education Singapore. (2020). *Character & Citizenship Education (CCE) Syllabus Secondary: Implementation starting from 2021.* Queenstown: Ministry of Education Singapore. Retrieved from https://www.moe.gov.sg/-/media/files/secondary/syllabuses/cce/2021-character-and-citizenship-education-secondary-syllabus.pdf?la=en&hash=2FA125FDB97090EE2068E2650E78D97A2D995493

OECD. (2018). *Preparing Our Youth.* Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2019). *PISA 2018 Assessment and Analytical Framework.* Paris: OECD Publishing. doi:10.178/b25efab8-en

Reynolds, R., MacQueen, S., & Ferguson-Patrick, K. (2019). Educating for global citizenship: Australia as a case study. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning, 11*(1), 103-119. doi:10.18546/IJDEGL.11.1.07

Ritchie, J., & Lewis, J. (Eds.). (2003). *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers.* London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Shi, Y., Chong, E. K., & Li, B. (2019). Chinese civic education being globalised: What changes have been made in civic education curriculum in China, Hong Kong and Macao. *Social Transformations in Chinese Societies, 15*(1), 37-63. doi:10.1108/STICS-11-2018-0016

UNESCO. (2014). *Global Citizenship Education: Preparing learners for the challenges of the twenty-first century.* France: UNESCO.

UNESCO. (2015). *Incheon Declaration and SDG4 – Education 2030 Framework for Action. For the Implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4, Ensure Inclusive and Equitable Quality Education and Promote Lifelong Learning Opportunities for All.* ED-2016/WS/28.

Voogt, J., & Roblin, N. P. (2010). *21st CENTURY SKILLS.* University of Twente, Department of Curriculum Design and Educational Innovation, Enschede.

Zúñiga, C. G., Cárdenas, P., Martínez, R., & Valledor, L. (2019). Teachers' classroom practices for citizenship education: Experiences of teachers rated as outstanding. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education, 00*(0), 1-20. doi:10.1177/2047173419887972